



MINUTES

A meeting of the Planning Advisory Commission was held Wednesday, January 16, 2019 in the Council Chambers of the Citizen Service Center.

Commissioners Present:

Chairperson: Kathleen Mason
Vice Chairperson: Ed Kinner
Commissioners: Michael Greenblatt, Robert Bollinger, Teddy Reese, Ralph King, Joseph Brannon, Wallace Davis & James Dudley

Staff Members: John Renfroe, Principal Planner

Commissioners Absent:

Others Present: Will Johnson, Chief Planner

CALL TO ORDER: Chairperson Mason called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. All in attendance stood for the pledge of allegiance to the American Flag. She explained the rezoning process to the audience.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: No minutes available for meeting.

1. REZN-12-18-2203: A request to rezone 0.34 acres of land located at 3707 2nd Avenue. Current zoning is GC (General Commercial) zoning district. The proposed zoning is RO (Residential Office). The proposed use is warehouse / apartments / office. The applicant is Justin Kreig. This property is located in Council District 8 (Garrett).

John Renfroe read the staff report for this case.

General Land Use:	Consistent Planning Area F
Current Land Use Designation:	General Commercial
Future Land Use Designation:	Mixed Use
Compatible with Existing Land-Uses:	Yes
Environmental Impacts:	The property does not lie within the floodway and floodplain area. The developer will need an

approved drainage plan prior to issuance of a Site Development permit, if a permit is required.

City Services:

Property is served by all city services.

Traffic Impact:

Average Annual Daily Trips (AADT) will decrease by 141 trips if used for warehouse / office / apartment use. The Level of Service (LOS) will remain at level C.

Traffic Engineering:

This site shall meet the Codes and regulations of the Columbus Consolidated Government for commercial usage.

School Impact:

N/A

Buffer Requirement:

N/A

Fort Benning's Recommendation:

N/A

DRI Recommendation:

N/A

Attitude of Property Owners:

Sixty (60) property owners within 300 feet of the subject properties were notified of the rezoning request. The Planning Department received 1 calls and/or emails regarding the rezoning.

Approval: 0 Calls

Opposition: 1 Calls

Additional Information:

N/A

Chairperson Mason asked the commissioners for questions; Commissioner Kinner pointed out that in the traffic report the annual daily trips number actually decreased 141 rather than increased which is shown on the staff report. Commissioner Dudley inquired about the requested parking spots of 27 rather than the required of 35. John Renfro responded that PAC could either put conditions on that here today or the applicant could go before BZA to request a variance.

Bill Green, 1631 Hilton Avenue representing Justin because he is unable to make the meeting this morning. This parcel use to be in what was downtown Bibb City. The requested use better fits the downtown urban center use better. Justin bought this property hoping that it would help stimulate redevelopment in this area. Reduction in parking spaces because the market determines the amount spaces, not minimums. You end up taking down old buildings to provide parking which defeats the purpose of repurposing these buildings downtown Bibb City.

Commissioner Dudley followed up on the parking, 2nd Avenue is a very busy street already, would you not be concerned with increased traffic due to people looking for spaces. Bill Green, the more you can encourage people to walk the better the development of the urban area is. We believe the market will drive the amount of spaces that is needed. We want people to think of this area as a hybrid urban area, not a suburban area. Commissioner Dudley is concerned that there isn't a major road like 2nd Avenue cutting uptown in half. He is concerned about people crossing the road for different uses. Bill Green, traffic speed is a concern but the long term solution is to slow down traffic even more to help this area.

Commissioner Reese, how many units will be located in this development. Bill Green, I believe it is 6 total units. 2 units on the bottom floor and 4 on the second floor. Commissioner Reese, the speed limit is 35 mph, there are a couple of businesses in that area that seem to be doing okay. Are there any plans to upgrade the look of the buildings to make them look better? Bill Green, we are hoping we can restore and update the buildings to their original state. Those business are doing just okay, they aren't really thriving.

Commissioner Dudley, for staff, residential uses are to be located above the ground floor. 2 apartments are to build on the ground floor, if we want to consider a motion do we need to have a condition to waive the ground floor requirements. John Renfroe, there would be a need for that condition.

Chairperson Mason, is there anyone that would like to speak in favor or against this request. No response.

Commissioner Reese, follow up question, if we move forward with this request, do we need to include the conditions in the motion? John Renfroe, yes. Commissioner Reese made a motion to approve the request with conditions to the bottom floor apartments and reduction in parking spaces required. Commissioner Kinner seconded the motion. The requests is approved with a 7-1 vote.

2. REZN-12-18-2247: A request to rezone 1.58 acres of land located at 1429 Morris Road. Current zoning is SFR2 (Single Family Residential 2). The proposed zoning is GC (General Commercial). The proposed use is business / retail. The applicant is Martin Flournoy. This property is located in Council District 1 (Barnes).

John Renfroe read the staff report for this case.

General Land Use:	Inconsistent Planning Area E
Current Land Use Designation:	Parks / Recreation / Conservation
Future Land Use Designation:	Parks / Recreation / Conservation

Compatible with Existing Land-Uses:	Yes
Environmental Impacts:	The property does not lie within the floodway and floodplain area. The developer will need an approved drainage plan prior to issuance of a Site Development permit, if a permit is required.
City Services:	Property is served by all city services.
Traffic Impact:	Average Annual Daily Trips (AADT) will increase by 191 trips if used for commercial use. The Level of Service (LOS) will remain at level B.
Traffic Engineering:	This site shall meet the Codes and regulations of the Columbus Consolidated Government for commercial usage.
School Impact:	N/A
Buffer Requirement:	The site shall include a Category C buffer along all property lines bordered by the SFR3 zoning district. The 3 options under Category C are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1) 20 feet with a certain amount of canopy trees, under story trees, and shrubs / ornamental grasses per 100 linear feet. 2) 10 feet with a certain amount of shrubs / ornamental grasses per 100 linear feet and a wood fence or masonry wall. 3) 30 feet undisturbed natural buffer.
Fort Benning's Recommendation:	N/A
DRI Recommendation:	N/A
Attitude of Property Owners:	Twenty-five (25) property owners within 300 feet of the subject properties were notified of the rezoning request. The Planning Department received 1 calls and/or emails regarding the rezoning. <p>Approval: 1 Calls</p> <p>Opposition: 0 Calls</p>
Additional Information:	N/A

Chairperson Mason asked the commissioners for questions, no questions. Martin Flournoy, representing the Boys and Girls Club East Columbus, my address is 2520 Wynnton Road. We have under contract Edgewood Elementary School and our intention is to move the entire operation there. Because this parcel is zoned Single Family, it is going to be extremely hard to find someone to occupy this site. We feel that a commercial use is better suited for this parcel and fits with the neighborhood. Commissioner Kinner stated that he thinks General Commercial at this location seems like a stretch and should be rezoned Neighborhood Commercial. Martin Flournoy responded that this building sits at the edge of an industrial area. We are currently targeting a church because we think it will really suite a need. Rezoning this parcel anything other than General Commercial is a mistake, it will more than likely sit vacant and we will be back here in a year trying to rezone it so it doesn't sit vacant. The nature of this building and location is going to dictate who comes in. The park and ballfield next door will play a large roll.

Chairperson Mason, is there anyone that would like to speak in favor or against this request. Rodney, CEO for the Boys and Girls Club. We are serving over 200 kids a day at this location and we are outgrowing the building.

Commissioner King made a motion to approve this request. Commissioner Davis seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous in favor.

3. REZN-12-18-2248: A request for a text amendment to amend the text of the Unified development Ordinance (UDO) in regards to Table 3.1.1 (Community Facilities)

John Renfroe read the staff report for this case.

Request to amend the text of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) in regards to Table 3.1.1. - Community Facilities to read as follows:

UNIFIED DEVELOPMENT ORDINANCE REVISIONS
(Explanation of Revisions)

1. Explanation of Revisions: Amend Table 3.1.1. by permitting Community Facilities with a Special Exception in the following districts:

Use Category	HIS T	RE 10	R E5	R E1	R T	SF R1	SF R2	SF R3	SF R4	RM F1	RM F2	M HP	U PT	CR D	N C	R O	C O	G C	SA C	L M I	H M I	TE CH	NO TES
Community Facilities	SE	SE	SE	SE	SE	SE	SE	SE	SE	SE	SE		P	P	P	P	P	P					

Chairperson Mason asked if the Commissioners if there are any questions, Commissioner

Kinner could you please describe what this request is and how it related to Edgewood School and also please give me a definition of what a community facility is. John Renfro, Boys and Girls Club as well as Girls Inc. are traditionally placed in residential areas but are consider commercial use. This text amendment would encompass many of the existing facilities as well as allow Edgewood school to operate in that capacity. The definition of Community Facilities reads as follows, means public or private facilities such as assembly halls, union halls, conference halls and centers, stadiums or arenas, or auditoriums including accessory office or administrative space; nonprofit clubs and lodges; art galleries, museums, libraries and theaters for live performances or films, videos or other electronic medium; golf courses and clubhouses, excluding mini golf; and public uses. Commissioners Dudley, that seems to be very broad and override a lot of existing definitions. They already have their own permitted or special exception use in table 3.1.1. Why don't we just amend Club or lodge, not for profit? Commissioners is there a definition that the Boys and Girls club would already fall under. John Renfro, as of right now there is not a zoning they would fall under. Commissioners Kinner, I fully support the use of Edgewood School for the Boys and Girls Club but I am against this text amendment because it is too broad and affects too many zoning districts. Roughly 80-90% of Columbus would be affected by this text amendment. If we would rezone Edgewood Elementary or present a new text amendment. Commissioner Reese, why wouldn't this fall under club or lodge, not for profit? Will Johnson, because the definition doesn't include educational. Commissioner Reese recommended educational and and/or and it would protect the broadness of the existing text amendment. Will Johnson, you could amend the text here today. Commissioner Brannon, so we would use the existing definition for Club or lodge, not for profit. Commissioner Dudley, is it the commissions intention to put SE for all of the residential areas? Commissioner Reese, the nature of the business is they needed to be in residential areas. Commissioners Bollinger, concerned with making a total new document, I would feel better if we went back and come back next session with the correct report from staff. Commissioner Kinner, why couldn't this be rezoned to General Commercial. Will Johnson, this particular location would be considered spot zoning. Commissioner Reese, is a variance for this particular location be an option. Will Johnson, it would not be. Either rezoned or a text amendment. We don't want to rezone this 12 acre area as general commercial. Commissioner Bollinger, my preference would be to bring it back and submit it properly reworded and presented. Commissioner Dudley, can we ask staff to come back next meeting with the changes. Commissioner King, the text amendment with special exceptions like these are allow the uses with oversight from the planning department, PAC and Council. Commissioner Brannon, I don't think we need to send it back to the planning department, we know what changes we need today. Chairperson Mason, we have 2 options. Table it and let the planning department come back in 2 weeks and present the updated staff report or you make the motion to make the change with the new wording. Commissioner Reese, the planning department is telling us what the changes would be made. Chairperson Mason, someone needs to speak verbally before we make the motion. Commissioner Brannon, amend the UDO to table 3.1.1 Club or Lodge, not for profit for the areas presented by the planning department and amend the definition to include "educational" and "and/or". Commissioner Dudley, does this include all of the zones originally presented. Commissioner Brannon, it does. Commissioner Dudley, that is much broader than what was originally presented. That includes the Historic District.

Commissioner Reese, why did staff present such a large area in which these would be allowed? Will Johnson, the special exception allows us to be selective and require the applicant to meet these criteria to be allowed in these areas? Chairperson Mason, yes it is broad but every case must past through this room and through PAC. John Renfroe, the original text allowed for Boys and Girls Club to be permitted in commercial areas without a special exception use. Commissioner Brannon, I will make the motion to not include in those areas, only the residential areas with a special exception use.

Chairperson Mason, is there anyone that would like to speak in favor or against this request. Molly Smith, 720 Broadway. It is alarming to me that a special exception is going to be allowed in areas that they aren't already like the historic district. I am oppose to having special exception available at all. I do not support this text amendment.

Chairperson Mason, do I hear a motion. Commissioner Brannon makes a motion to approve the new wording to allow special exception uses for Club or lodge, not for profit and to amend the definition in chapter 13. Commissioner King seconded. The vote was 5-4 in favor, Chairperson Mason was the final approving vote.

4. EXCP-12-18-2246: A request for special exception use at 3835 Forest Road. Current zoning is SFR2 (Single Family Residential 2). The proposed use is community facility. Martin Flournoy is the applicant. This property is located in Council District 1 (Barnes)

(1) Access: Is or will the type of street providing access to the use be adequate to serve the proposed special exception use?

Forest Road is a minor arterial road. It will provide adequate free flow movement.

(2) Traffic and Pedestrian Safety : Is or will access into and out of the property be adequate to provide for traffic and pedestrian safety, the anticipated volume of the traffic flow, and access by emergency vehicles?

Access into and out of the property in question will provide for adequate traffic and pedestrian safety and emergency access.

(3) Adequacy of Public Facilities: Are or will public facilities such as school, water, or sewer utilities and police and fire protection be adequate to serve the special exception use?

Services such as water, sewer, utilities, police, and fire protection are adequate.

(4) Protection from Adverse Affects: Are or will refuse, service, parking and loading areas on the property be located or screened to protect other properties in the area from such adverse effects as noise, light, glare or odor?

The property is surrounded by SFR2. Noise, light, flare and odor should be limited due to the nature of the facility.

(5) Hours of Operation: Will the hours and manner of operation of the special exception use have no adverse effects on other properties in the area?

The hours of operation for this use will not have an adverse impact on the neighboring properties in the area.

(6) Compatibility: Will the height, size, or location of the buildings or other structures on the property be compatible with the height, size, character, or location of buildings or other structures on neighboring properties?

This structures height, size and location should match the uses found in other SFR2 (Single Family Residential 2) properties.

Council District: District 1 (Barnes)

Seventy-five (75) property owners within 300 feet of the property have been notified by mail of the proposed Special Exception Use. The Planning Department received 1 calls and/or emails regarding the special exception use.

Approval:	1 Calls
Opposition:	0 Calls

Additional Information: N/A

Chairperson Mason asked if the Commissioners if there are any questions, no response.

Martin Flournoy, need this special exception approval in order for the Boys and Girls Club to operate at the Edgewood Elementary site.

Commissioner Kinner, can we proceed with this special exception approval at the same time as the text amendment change. Will Johnson, yes you can do both at the same time as long as the text amendment was approved. The text amendment goes to first reading, then on the 2nd reading if the text amendment is passed, the special exception follows directly behind.

Chairperson Mason, is there anyone that would like to speak in favor or against this request. No response.

Commissioner Brannon makes a motion to approve the request. Commissioner Bollinger seconds the motion. The vote is unanimous.

5. REZN-11-18-2155: A request to amend the text of the Unified Development Ordinance in regards to section 4.6.4a, 4.6.12f and 13.1.1.

Chairperson Mason commented that the commission was given new documentation this morning so she made the recommendation to table this case.

Commissioner Greenblatt made the motion to table this request until next meeting. Commissioner Dudley commented that it his understanding that the changes they requested were included in the updated amendment. Commissioner King seconds the motion to table. The vote is unanimous.

6. REZN-01-19-2155: A request to amend the text of the Unified Development Ordinance in regards to Table 3.1.1. (Health and Fitness Facilities)

Request to amend the text of the Unified Development Ordinance (UDO) in regards to Table 3.1.1. – Health and Fitness Facilities to read as follows:

UNIFIED DEVELOPMENT ORDINANCE REVISIONS
(Explanation of Revisions)

1. Explanation of Revisions: Amend Table 3.1.1. by permitting Health and Fitness Facilities with a Special Exception in the following districts:

Use Category	HIS T	RE 10	R E5	R E1	R T	SF R1	SF R2	SF R3	SF R4	RM F1	RM F2	M HP	U PT	CR D	N C	R O	C O	G C	SA C	L M I	H M I	TE CH	NO TES
Health & Fitness Facility	SE												P	P	P	P	P	P	P				

John Renfro, commented on that they received 40 total responses. 9 were in opposition, 25 were in favor for.

Chairperson Mason asked if the Commissioners if there are any questions, no response.

Will Johnson, began PowerPoint presentation that was created by John Hudginson, Inspections and Codes Department Head.

PowerPoint attached.

Chairperson Mason asked if the Commissioners if there are any questions. Commissioner Dudley, Council has said that rezoning is off the table? Will Johnson, professionally I would love to rezone that entire commercial block. The Historic District line has been hard and fast along 9th street. Commissioner Greenblatt, who is actually requesting the text amendment? Joann Cogle completed the application. Commissioner Kinner, if this text amendment is approved or disapproved what happens? Will Johnson, Mrs. Cogle was given 120 day temporary CO by city Council. If this text amendment is denied, it will go to city Council. If it is approved she will come back next month with a special exception. We did not put them on the same agenda to run at the same time. Commissioner Brannon, is there a way when doing a special exception to have a minimum space requirement? Will Johnson, parking is a problem with the Historic District. 7th Street Provisions was going to be denied because they didn't have parking. They were able to secure off street parking within 500' of their business. Commissioner Brannon that is a checklist item? Commissioner Dudley, will the yoga studio also be affected? It was given a CO as an assessor use, which was given in error and they might be effected.

Chairperson Mason, is there anyone that would like to speak in favor of this request.

Fred Green, 725 Broadway. If there was ever a use for a fitness facility in a neighborhood it is ours with how many people run, walk, workout. With a properly vetted special exception it is acceptable.

Ernie Smallman, 6 7th Street. The special exception allows for the exact same process we are going through now. Green Island has 2 gyms, it isn't out of the ordinary to have a gym in a neighborhood environment.

Citizens sitting in the audience that are in favor of the motion: 11

Stacy Mood, Phenix City. Approves.

Chairperson Mason, is there anyone that would like to speak in opposition of this request.

Fran Poole Carpenter, 748 Broadway. I won 2 properties in the historic district. If the text amendment is approved and the special exceptions comes to PAC will it be required to have parking? John Renfro, yes it will be required to have on street parking. That would be dictated by the size of the property. Fran Poole Carpenter, my concern is not about this particular location but other businesses finding ways to open in the historic district. There is an apartment building is next to our home, what would keep someone from building a gym at this location? It has parking.

Commissioner Brannon, BHAR would have to be included and have approval for anything to be rebuilt at the apartment location. Will Johnson that is part of the reason that there isn't a hotel sitting there right now.

Citizens sitting in the audience that are in opposition of the motion: 13

Commissioner Grenblatt, I need comment that I'm not sure how the email chains and communication has transpired in this case, I don't think that is how this committee is supposed to function. It is concerning. All of the information should go through Staff and then back to us.

Commissioner Reese, the individual in the gym made financial improvements in the gym with the impression that everything was good with CO and business license. John Renfro, that's correct. Commissioner Reese, if this is ultimately denied, what recourse does the applicant have?

Chairperson Mason, any business owner or lease person is 100% at fault and responsible for what they are signing for.

Will Johnson, her last option is to rezone to CRD and whatever options she has in the legal world.

Commissioner Brannon, is this request from the planning department or from Joann Cogle? Will Johnson, Council tasked us with finding a solution and this is what we came up with.

Commissioner Reese, it is your impression that Council is favor for the text amendment change. Will Johnson, I can't comment on that. We are handling the text amendment, but after that we are out. Commissioner Reese, if Council put this in motion they should have let us know since they

ultimately have the final say. Will Johnson, you are an independent organization that will make a recommendation.

Chairperson Mason, is there anyone that would like to speak in favor or against this request. No response.

Commissioner Brannon, made a motion to approve the request. James Dudley seconded the motion.

Commissioner Greenblatt, a correction needs to be made, it's not just the historic district right? John Renfroe, no it is just the historic district.

3 approve and 4 denial. Commissioner Reese, for the record I am abstaining.

Commissioner Greenblatt, motion to deny. Davis seconded the motion. 4 denials and 3 approvals

NEW BUSINESS:

Commissioner Greenblatt, recommended Commissioner King as Chair and Commissioner Bollinger and Vice Chair. Commissioner Kinner seconds the motion. The vote passes unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS: N/A

ADJOURNMENT: 10:41 AM

Kathleen Mason, Chairperson

John Renfroe, Principal Planner